A Post-2015 Development Agenda by People Living in Poverty

July 14-19, 2013
Voice for Change - A Post-2015 Development Agenda by People Living in Poverty
Reprint 2013

© Praxis Institute for Participatory Practices, 2012. This work is licensed under http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-sa/3.0/deed.en_US.
An Indian postage stamp to commemorate *Voice for Change: A Post 2015 Development Agenda by People Living in Poverty* was issued by the Department of Post, Government of India.
Letter from Members of the Ground Level Panel, India, on the Post-2015 Development Agenda to the Secretary General, United Nations

Secretary General,
United Nations

We, the fourteen members of the Ground Level Panel in India have deliberated on the 12 goals that the High Level Panel has submitted to you. As you and United Nations member states deliberate on these recommendations, we would like to place our recommendations alongside.

We are thankful to the United Nations and the member states for taking cognisance of some of our issues and bringing global consensus on eradicating extreme poverty.

Our expertise is our lived experience - an experience of poverty and continuous marginalisation. We discussed and deliberated many issues between 14 and 18 July 2013 and spent a significant amount of time learning from each other.

As a process, we first reviewed the status of our lives vis-a-vis the eight Millennium Development Goals (MDGs). Post that, we also looked into recommendations of the High Level Panel – their analysis and their 12 goals for the post-2015 development framework. Our Indian Constitution, in 1950, directed successive governments to ensure Food, Shelter, Health, Education and Livelihood to all citizens. Again in the year 2000, the MDGs reaffirmed these goals. We agreed that these are our dreams as well, but we need the targets to be set on the means to overcome those barriers, which have prevented governments from achieving these goals. We have identified many such impediments that are fundamental and we must find both the political will and institutional mechanisms to overcome these.

While we have multiple identities, we do not claim these as a representative voice of everyone. These are our views based on our lived experiences of poverty and marginalisation.

We are thankful for the valuable support provided to us by the Panel’s Secretariat, Praxis Institute for Participatory Practices.

We hope this report feeds into different discourses on what kind of goals should become part of Post-2015 development framework.

Members of the Ground-Level Panel
It has been a truly humbling experience to listen to an unadulterated, grounded take on the Post 2015 agenda from the members of the Ground Level Panel that deliberated on the subject. “If democracy binds us as a family, then why do we get excluded and treated differently” - wondered the panelists. The panel dissected this and many more issues threadbare, not from an academic point of view, but from their own and their communities’ life experiences. They did not stop with raising issues, but went on to look at the role of different players, stumbling blocks, a way forward and institutional mechanisms for bringing about change.

The breadth and depth of lived experiences that were shared during the deliberations make you wonder why. Why are we deaf to the voices of people living in poverty, while making policies, taking decisions? The panel was clear that it is not that the government and its machinery is ignorant of the issues, but have deliberately chosen not to respond. One of the panel members likened it to cats being fed just enough for survival so that they stay alive and serve the purpose of feeding on rats!

How long can we be deaf to these voices? How long will we keep them on cat ration? Not for too long if the energy and optimism that the panel reverberated are any indication. The panel was clear that even in the face of situations where the poor give up under the weight of their predicament, (कठनायों में गरीब थक के बेठ जाते है, हम चल रहे है) we keep our strides with the faith of success (कामयाबी के उम्मीद लेकर हम चल रहे है).

Ground Level Panels are definitely emerging as a powerful mechanism for democratising policy making and facilitating the India round has been a truly enriching experience.

Tom Thomas
Dear Friends,

The Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) are a promise to the world’s poorest and most vulnerable. They are a pledge to build decent, healthier lives for billions of people. Since they were adopted in 2000, the MDGs have made a great difference to people the world over. The MDGs have mobilized governments as never before. They have catalyzed dynamic new partnerships. And -- most importantly -- they have achieved results. Today, six hundred million people have risen from extreme poverty.

While there is much to celebrate, much remains to be done. The tragic truth is that over a billion people still live in abject poverty. This is unacceptable. There are less than 1,000 days to go before the end of 2015. Less than 1,000 days of action. Much can be achieved before the 2015 deadline. What’s needed is political leadership and delivery of those financial resources committed over the past decade.

As we look forward to the post-2015 development agenda, our first task is to fulfil -- insofar as possible -- the promise of the MDGs.

Going forward to the future we want, our first priority is to eradicate extreme poverty and hunger. We must do this by listening to the voices of those who are suffering the most, but also who stand to benefit the most - the people living in extreme poverty.

Sustainable development is about people and their responsible use of the world’s resources.

The Ground Level Panel Report gives us a unique opportunity to amplify the voices of people who experience poverty, insecurity and exclusion on a daily basis. These are our true experts in development and their input is critical in ensuring the post-2015 development agenda truly leaves no one behind.

Thank you for your attention. I wish you a successful and productive meeting.
MESSAGE

UNITED NATIONS RESIDENT COORDINATOR

LISE GRANDE

As the Head of the 27 United Nations agencies that have the privilege of serving in India, we welcome and applaud the work of the Ground Level Panel and the commitment of its members to help shape the new framework that will replace the Millennium Development Goals after 2015.

An unprecedented global dialogue about the new framework is underway. Never before, perhaps, have so many people come together to discuss great development issues, separated by continents but combined in their aspirations for sustainable human development.

India is one of the 90 countries that has held a broad-based national consultation on the post 2015 development agenda this past year. Eight national conveners, representing the government, trade unions, industry, women’s associations, farmer’s associations, research institutions, civil society and youth organizations have convened constituency-based discussions throughout the country.

During the five-month process, national conveners organised more than 75 community, state, regional and national constituency-based consultations in 24 States and Union Territories. An estimated 15,000 people directly participated in the consultations, 25 per cent of whom were women; thousands of organizations, with a collective representative membership of 400 million from across India, have been involved in the process.

Many constituencies involved in the national consultation feel strongly that the framework which replaces the Millennium Development Goals must start by reaffirming the human rights principles enshrined in the Millennium Declaration and the principles of sustainable and equitable development agreed at the Rio+20 Conference in 2012. All of the conveners have confirmed the importance of ensuring that the views of the people who live in poverty and are the most marginalised are given central place in the international dialogue.

We congratulate the organisers of Ground Level Panel for the important initiative of bringing together people who are living with poverty and daily face the problem of exclusion.

Your recommendations will help to ensure that the new global development framework is reflective of reality and that the new goals promised by the international community are truly transformative.
What is the Ground-Level Panel

The Ground-Level Panel consists of 14 members from diverse background living in poverty and experiencing marginalisation who came together for five days from July 14-18, 2013 to deliberate on their responses and recommendations to the United Nations High-Level Panel report on the post-2015 global development framework. They are not members of any government, private or non-governmental organisations or associated with any political parties or trade unions. In fact, they are not in any formal or regular employment with any organisation - government or private. Instead, the panelists draw on their experiences of marginalisation and exclusion to provide a ‘ground-level’ reality check to the High-Level Panel, co chaired by the Prime Minister of the United Kingdom and the Presidents of Indonesia and Liberia.

Background


Several organisations are leading consultations with representatives from the ground, sector experts and policy makers to feed into this process. Praxis Institute for Participatory Practices (www.praxisindia.org), an organisation working on issues of inclusion and governance will build and support the Ground-Level Panel as part of a global research initiative called Participate to deliberate on existing recommendations from global policy spaces for a post 2015 framework for international development. The findings are being shared at an exhibition-cum-discussion in Delhi on July 19. The process is part of similar initiatives organised by the Centre for Development Services in Egypt, International Movement of All Together for Dignity Fourth World in Brazil and Restless Development in Uganda.

Process and goals

The Ground-Level Panel employed a deliberative and participative dialogue process, during which the 14 participants discussed how the Millennium Development Goals have impacted their lives and how any future development framework that will affect their lives should be. The aim of the panel is to provide a counterpoint to the dominance of ‘professional, political and academic voices in the global policy-making processes’ and will bring people from the poorest and most marginalised communities together to deliberate on what should be the core elements of an international framework, drawing on external evidence and the evidence of their own experience.

This is a collation of the findings and key messages emerging from these deliberations in order to understand the global patterns and dissonances in the critiques that are built. The panelists have deliberated on key questions which relate to post-2015 framework for international development using their own experience and knowledge. They have reflected, made recommendations and given reasons for their recommendations, which are being shared with civil society, government agencies and the media through this document to collectively voice for change.
The Panelists

Amrita Naik, a 17-year-old tribal girl from Odisha, cherishes the achievement of her project on future solution of soil conservation in mountain area being selected for the National Science Congress. Her life took a turn for the worse when her mother died. She was only 11 years old. Her father, who was unemployed and an alcoholic, married another woman. She had to fend for herself by working on construction sites. She ran away fearing that her father would get her married off as customary in her community. A woman at whose house she lived in brought her to Kalinga Institute of Social Studies, a residential school for tribal children that provides free education. Amrita feels she is fortunate for having had the opportunity to complete her schooling. She wants to be a lawyer. She envisions a world free from foeticide, child marriage, corruption, superstition and illiteracy.

Joshna Pradan, 22, fought for her family’s right over their one acre of land in their village in Kandhamal district of Odisha. She studied up to Class 10 and now works as an agricultural labourer in her village. She works hard to take care of her mother and younger siblings. When Joshna lost her father at a very young age, her uncle took possession of the one acre of land their family owned, which was their only means of survival. He also separated her elder brothers from them. She, her mother and her younger siblings had to starve for days on end. They survived on the wild roots she used to bring from the forest. When she grew up, Joshna summoned the village panchayat and fought for their land. Thanks to her efforts, they have got back a small portion of the land.

Mayavati, 29, is from Kisani ka purva village in Unchahar Block of Rai Bareily district of Uttar Pradesh who has combated poverty and discrimination to educate her children. Being a Dalit, her father was unfairly paid for work he did in the fields of the landlord and she spent many days in her childhood going hungry. She longed to step out her house alone, but was never allowed to by her strict father. She got married at 15 hoping that things would change, but they did not. She had to work in a rice mill from where she saved up the residue of broken rice mixed with stones to feed her husband and two children. Eventually she got involved with a savings group in her village, which helped her save money and take loans to put her children in school. She also set up her own petty shop. She wants to help other women and believes that no amount of cash transfers will help alleviate poverty. She sees collectivisation to be the only solution. She dreams about a world where all children go to school.

Mohammad Akbar, 40, lives in Gondi Ibrahim Patan of Baramula district of Kashmir and is proud of having helped the people of his village get various benefits since he became the president of the Village Development Committee six years ago. He dropped out of school after Class 10 to support his family and now works in a local shop to sustain his family of 10. Prior to 2007, the conflict between the army and militants disrupted life and frequent indefinite strikes took a toll on his children’s education. Akbar always wanted to work for the welfare of his community and his dream came true when an NGO approached their village to improve local governance and livelihood opportunities. He helped BPL families in the village access various government benefits. Akbar wants to see significant changes in the village and he wants to help his people.
**Mohammad Ismail**, aged 29, was a member of a rescue team that helped people to safety during the 2004 tsunami. He lives in Chennai and was diagnosed with 70% disability because of polio at the age of eight. His disability did not deter his spirit. He completed Class 12 in the corporation school and started looking for a job to support his family. In 2002, his already impoverished family suffered a jolt when the slum in which they were living was notified for eviction to make way for a commercial boating site. Despite protests, 1500 houses including his, were demolished. Their belongings were thrown out and the inhabitants were moved to a relocation site called Kannagi Nagar on the outskirts of Chennai. Ismail has been desperately looking for a job in private companies but in vain because the area he hails from is considered notorious. On one occasion, he finally got a job in a private company but the company cancelled his appointment when he submitted his address proof. Iqbal wants a world that has employment for everyone, clean habitats, safety for children, a common school system and an effective police that does not act as the servant of the affluent.

**Mohammad Samsul Haque**, 45, is a migrant labourer from Guwahati, Assam, who has studied up to Class 5 but managed to educate his two sons. His elder son is doing his graduation. Haque, who was a farmer from Nimua Latima village in Nalbari district of Assam, migrated to Guwahati to work as a daily wage labourer to make ends meet after regular floods disrupted his fields. He works at a garage as a screen painter during the day and spends his nights as a caretaker in the shop of a local businessman. He goes home during the harvest season to help his family on the fields. There has been a significant change in the agricultural scenario over the past few years because of an NGO that renovated the canals his village – a task the government failed to do for 25 years. But he still finds it difficult to get a job in the city, especially in the rainy season. He looks forward to the day when all citizens will be able to enjoy all rights.

**Nandlal**, 42, has overcome the discrimination he faced because of his disability to work for the rights of people with disabilities. Hailing from Tehsil Salempur, Devaria district of Uttar Pradesh, Nandlal started driving a truck at a young age. His life took a tragic turn when he lost both legs in a road accident at the age of 18. Taunted by family members and neighbours because of his disability, he left his village and came to Delhi. He started living on the footpath near India Gate and has worked with several NGOs. He educated himself and read many spiritual books and derived the confidence to face life. Nandlal feels bad when he sees people look at physically challenged beggars sympathetically and wonders why they never come forward to give them work and make them independent. He dreams of a world where people look at the physically challenged as equals, not as people worthy of pity.

**Pinki** is a 17-year-old girl from Shivnala Village in Bulandshahar, Uttar Pradesh, who is among the few girls in her village who have got the opportunity to study. She belongs to a Dalit family and is the second of seven siblings. Pinki had to assert her desire to study quite aggressively with her parents before she was allowed to go to school. She feels that the biggest problem in her village is the lack of health facilities, unavailability of electricity and absence of employment opportunities for adults. At a seminar on Human Rights, Pinki was amazed to learning that women in other places have the right to choose whom they want to marry. She wants to be a computer engineer when she grows up and set up a business of her own which can provide young girls the opportunity to study. She dreams of a world where the poor are free from suffering and there is no discrimination of opportunities between boys and girls.
Sixty-five-year-old **Raghunath Sada** led a land rights movement against local landlords in the Ujjwa Paschim village of Kusheswarthan of the Darbhanga district of Bihar. Thanks to his relentless fight for the Musahars, the community to which he belongs, acquired 62 acres of land. He also got two bighas of land, which help him sustain his family. His village remains waterlogged for four to five months every year. The Musahar community is the most disadvantaged community of Bihar and Sada has been voicing their issues through his writings and discussions in various fora. He believes that though the Bihar government has declared Musahars as ‘Mahadalits’, his community lives in extreme poverty. His wants to help Musahar children gain access to education and he believes that, at least, housing should be the primary step towards the well-being of the landless Musahar families, followed by land redistribution.

**Ravikant Redkar**, 32, is affected by cerebral palsy and lives in a slum in North Mumbai. The happiest day of his life was when the telephone booth he runs was inaugurated in the presence of his mother. Ravikant points out how the paradigm shift in communication arena of India has put his sole livelihood option in crisis as few people use telephone booths in an age where almost everybody has a mobile. But Ravikant still nurtures the hope to overcome the present challenge as he thinks some good people still exist in society who believe people with disabilities people can be part of the development process. Ravikant is currently also associated with an NGO through which he advocates for rights of people with disabilities.

**Sunita Devi**, 28, belongs to the Paswan community and was born in Patna. She has studied till Class 12 and moved to Samastipur, Bihar, after marriage. She lives there with her four daughters and her husband. Sunita is a tailor and earns a living stitching clothes for women and small children in her village to supplement her husband's meagre income. She believes that she is an independent woman as she does not have to ask people for help. In fact, she said with pride that she helps others in need. Ten years down the line, she sees herself doing good for society and helping people live a better life.

**Ushaben Dineshbhai Vasava**, 33, is a tribal woman from Panchpiri village, Sagbara Taluka of Narmada district of Gujarat, who is leading a team managing an agricultural tool library in her village. Through her initiatives, the village has road, water supply to individual households, construction of bio gas plants and vermin-compost unit among the group members. Ushaben recalls the time when many people did not have access to drinking water. People were silent and did not have courage to raise their voice. She hopes that one day all women of her village will come out and raise their voice against their hardship and demand rights. She also dreams that women of her village should be economically empowered and this would make them self-reliant.
Uzma is a 16-year-old girl from Delhi who takes care of her mentally ill mother with pride. She feeds and bathes her regularly. She also takes care of her three younger siblings. She used to live and beg on the streets near Jama Masjid along with her mother and siblings. Since 2010, she and her siblings have been staying in a shelter home run by an NGO. She now learns to operate a computer and attends spoken English classes. With the help of a bridge course, she has completed studying till Class 6. She wants to be self-reliant so that she can take responsibility for her mother and siblings. She dreams of a world where young children do not have to live on the streets.

Vineetha, a 35-year-old transgender, migrated from Kolkata to Chennai 26 years ago and has been working for the welfare for her community members. She lived with a partner for 13 years and brought up a destitute girl along with him. Five years ago, she was forced to leave her partner and her adopted girl in a crisis. She decided to leave her house and other belongings to them. She started life from scratch and since then has been making ends meet by begging and dancing. She lives in a rented accommodation. She advises other transgenders not to become addicted to alcohol and tobacco. She is concerned about government apathy towards the welfare of transgenders while actively engaging with like-minded individuals to advocate on their behalf with various government departments. She emphasises that the government should focus on the education and employment of her community members as they are crucial to ensure lives of dignity for them.

Identities in the Group

The group of 14 represented several identities - there were seven women, one transgender and six men in the team, of whom three were children, one was over 60 and eight hailed from rural areas whereas six were from urban areas and nine were landless. The group had religious diversity with four Muslims, one Christian, a free thinker and the rest who were Hindu. There were six Dalits and three tribals in the group, one person each from a disaster affected and conflict affected area and three persons with disabilities. The word cloud here illustrates the identities represented in the group. The sizes of words in the image below represents the frequency of occurrence of these identities:
The Process

The fourteen GLP participants spent five days dialoguing and deliberating various issues in the context of the United Nations High-Level Panel report on the post-2015 global development framework. The broad discussion themes are indicated in the diagram below:

Response to the High Level Panel Recommendations

The Ground Level Panel went through a detailed process of understanding what was contained in the HLP report and discussed what they felt were gaps in the same, based on ground reality. The table below summarises contents of the HLP report as well as the gaps identified by the GLP (the images in the table below have been redrawn by the facilitators and participants to contextualise it to local settings for better understanding):

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>HLP Goals</th>
<th>WHAT IT CONTAINS</th>
<th>WHAT GLP THOUGHT WAS MISSING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 1. End Poverty | 1. End people living in extreme poverty (less than $1.25 per day) and reduce share of people below national poverty line
2. Increase share of women and men, communities, and businesses with secure rights to land, property, and other assets
3. Cover people with social protection systems and build resilience and reduce deaths from natural disasters | 1. The officials who issue BPL cards to those who are above the poverty line should be dismissed.
2. The government should provide the poor with good houses instead of plastic sheets.
3. The government should provide the poor with housing and shelter.
4. Poverty is an indication of government indifference and apathy.
5. The poor should be provided with government jobs.
6. Effective steps must be taken by to reduce poverty.
7. There should be a platform to get the voices of poor women heard.
8. Transparency in the funds allocated for public welfare |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>HLP Goals</th>
<th>WHAT IT CONTAINS</th>
<th>WHAT GLP THOUGHT WAS MISSING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>3</strong> Provide Quality Education and Lifelong Learning</td>
<td>1. Increase proportion of children completing pre-primary education  2. Ensure quality of education at primary level  3. Improve access to secondary education and learning outcomes  4. Increase work related skills, technical and vocational education</td>
<td>1. Free secondary education for girls to prevent them from dropping out because of limited family resources  2. Common school system for all -rich and poor  3. Parents and family should encourage children go to school (and those who discourage them should be punished)  4. Establishing more schools in villages and rural areas.  5. Admission in schools on the basis of merit and not bribery.  6. Education should be provided until an individual becomes self-reliant  7. Competent and efficient teachers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4</strong> Ensure Healthy Lives</td>
<td>1. End preventable infant and under-5 deaths  2. Increase vaccination coverage for children, adolescents, at-risk adults and older people  3. Decrease maternal mortality  4. Universalise sexual and reproductive health and rights  5. Reduce disease from HIV/ AIDS, tuberculosis, malaria, neglected tropical diseases and priority non-communicable diseases</td>
<td>1. Reduce corruption in accessing health services  2. Health counselling for all, once in three months and provide medicines accordingly  3. Hospital within a radius of 20 kms in villages so that people get timely treatment.  4. Concession in medical expenses for the poor and needy in private hospitals.  5. Health for all.  6. Compulsory premarital HIV testing so that couples can lead a healthy life.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HLP Goals</td>
<td>WHAT IT CONTAINS</td>
<td>WHAT GLP THOUGHT WAS MISSING</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| **5** Ensure Food Security and Good Nutrition | 1. End hunger and protect the right of everyone to have access to sufficient, safe, affordable, and nutritious food  
2. Reduce child malnutrition and anaemia  
3. Increase agricultural productivity by sustainably increasing smallholder yields and access to irrigation  
4. Adopt sustainable agricultural, ocean and freshwater fishery practices and rebuild designated fish stocks to sustainable levels  
5. Reduce post-harvest loss and food waste | 1. Use of natural manure in crops  
2. Transparency in public distribution system and enquiries should be made against cases of malpractices.  
3. Proper planning by the govt in order to ensure fair distribution of food for all.  
4. Good quality ration at a reasonable price in the public distribution system.  
5. Clean, free drinking water for all |
| **6** Achieve Universal Access to Water and Sanitation | 1. Provide universal access to safe drinking water  
2. End open defecation  
3. Ensure universal access to sanitation at school and work, and improve access at home  
4. Align freshwater withdrawals in line with supply and increase water efficiency in agriculture, industry and urban areas  
5. Recycle or treat all municipal and industrial wastewater prior to discharge | 1. Toilets in each household so that open defecation is avoided.  
2. Connecting rivers  
3. Free availability of drinking water.  
4. Rainwater harvesting and conservation of water resources.  
5. Steps to ensure that sea-water is fit for drinking.  
6. Adequate water supply in railway stations.  
7. Clean toilets and sanitation |
| **7** Secure Sustainable Energy | 1. Double the share of renewable energy in the global energy mix  
2. Ensure universal access to modern energy services  
3. Double the global rate of improvement in energy efficiency in buildings, industry, agriculture and transport  
4. Phase out inefficient fossil fuel subsidies that encourage wasteful consumption | 1. Those who have livestock should promote the use of bio-gas  
2. Using windmills to produce energy.  
3. Solar energy options should be made available even to the poor  
4. Encourage solar cars and vehicles.  
5. Rain water harvesting |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>HLP Goals</th>
<th>WHAT IT CONTAINS</th>
<th>WHAT GLP THOUGHT WAS MISSING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 8 | Create Jobs, Sustainable Livelihoods, and Equitable Growth | 1. Increase jobs and livelihoods  
2. Decrease the number of young people not in education, employment or training  
3. Providing universal access to financial services and infrastructure (transportation and ICT)  
4. Increase new start-ups with enabling business environment and boosting entrepreneurship | 1. The poor should have employment, livelihood and a life with dignity.  
2. End corruption  
3. Surveys should be carried out responsibly to guarantee employment to the poor  
4. Right to employment and reservation for the disabled  
5. Employment on the basis of merit  
6. Financial assistance to the unemployed  
7. Create an enabling work environment for women and transgenders  
8. Secure government jobs to more families |
| 9 | Manage Natural Resource Assets Sustainably | 1. Publish and use economic, social and environmental accounts in all governments and major companies  
2. Increase consideration of sustainability in government procurements  
3. Safeguard ecosystems, species and genetic diversity  
4. Reduce deforestation and increase reforestation  
5. Improve soil quality, reduce soil erosion and combat desertification | 1. Promote afforestation and prohibit deforestation.  
2. Use of natural manures.  
3. Trees should not be cut by the govt or private enterprise in the name of development.  
4. Control population explosion.  
5. Each household should plant at least one tree.  
6. Rivers and other natural resources should not be polluted.  
7. Trees should be planted in spaces where roads or any other infrastructure cannot be built.  
8. More botanical gardens should be encouraged. |
| 10 | Ensure Good Governance and Effective Institutions | 1. Provide free and universal legal identity (as birth registrations)  
2. Ensure freedom of speech, association, peaceful protest and access to independent media and information  
3. Increase public participation in political processes and civic engagement at all levels  
4. Guarantee the public’s right to information and access to government data  
5. Reduce bribery and corruption and ensure officials can be held accountable | 1. Participation of the poor in framing laws and policies.  
2. The poor should not be treated like dirt/filth.  
3. Govt-corporate nexus to be broken  
4. Impactful policies with maximum beneficiaries.  
5. Land acquisition by the corporates to be controlled  
6. Policies are implemented only on paper and not in practice.  
7. Responsive and accountable government  
8. Cooperation and collaboration with NGOs and voluntary organisations. |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>HLP Goals</th>
<th>WHAT IT CONTAINS</th>
<th>WHAT GLP THOUGHT WAS MISSING</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. Ensure justice institutions are accessible, independent, well-resourced and</td>
<td>2. Equal rights and a right to a life with dignity for transgenders.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>respect due-process rights</td>
<td>3. Food-clothing-shelter-education-health should be available for all for a peaceful society.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. Stem the external stressors that lead to conflict, including organised crime.</td>
<td>4. A spiritual mind and tolerance towards others.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4. Enhance the capacity, professionalism and accountability of the security</td>
<td>5. No party politics and discrimination along party lines.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>forces, police and judiciary</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Catalyse Long-Term Finance</td>
<td>2. Implement reforms to ensure stability of the global financial system and</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>encourage long-term private foreign investment</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. Hold the increase in global average temperature in line with international</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>agreements</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4. Developed countries that have not done so to make concrete efforts towards the</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>target official development assistance to developing countries and to least</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>developed countries</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5. Other countries should move toward voluntary targets for complementary</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>financial assistance</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6. Reduce illicit flows and tax evasion and increase stolen-asset recovery</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7. promote collaboration on and access to science, technology, innovation, and</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>development data</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The Post-2015 Inclusive Development Agenda by the Ground-Level Panel

As stated in the process, once the participants identified gaps in the HLP recommendations they did a detailed sectoral analysis from the point of view of excluded groups. This included: i) The rural poor, ii) The urban poor, iii) Dalits, Tribals and Minorities, iv) People affected by disaster and conflict, v) Children, vi) Women and Transgenders, vii) People with disabilities - and came up with a framework for the way forward. Issues of the elderly were discussed across all groups.

It was first agreed by the group that all human beings should have access to the basic needs basket which contained five elements as shown in the image below:

With the vision of ensuring these five basic needs to all human beings, irrespective of their gender, age, faith, ability, caste and creed the panel embarked on setting goals for realising these visions. The goals produced by the ground level panel are:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ILLUSTRATIONS</th>
<th>GROUND-LEVEL PANEL’S GOALS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| ![Image](image.png) | **GOAL 1**  
Establish a corruption-free society and state:  
Corruption is all-pervasive. Even national-level movements on corruption have been sidelined by political parties. |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>GROUND-LEVEL PANEL’S GOALS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **GOAL 2**  
Promote Equity:  
The state shall recognise the need for creating a level-playing field so that everyone has an equal opportunity to realise their dreams. Therefore, there is need for reservation and targeted support, be they poor, Dalits, tribals, minorities, women, the elderly, transgender, children, slums dwellers and people with disabilities. |
| **GOAL 3**  
Establish robust accountability mechanisms:  
There should be more transparency in the way that the state works and more information should be made available to the public free. This needs to build on the right to information and proactive of sharing information. There should also be better grievance redressal mechanisms. An emphasis should also be placed on collectivisation of people. |
| **GOAL 4**  
Provide identities not doles:  
Groups that are excluded and marginalised – including the transgender community, people with disabilities, Dalits, religious minorities should all be recognised as equal citizens. Care should be taken to ensure that identities, rather than labels are established. |
| **GOAL 5**  
Create institutional spaces:  
To promote people’s participation in local governance and policy-making processes. |
| GOAL 6 | End discrimination and stigma: 
Based on identities such as caste, language, disability, sexual orientation, gender, age, religion and region. |
|--------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| GOAL 7 | Abolish such traditions and practices that sustain discrimination in society: 
As the caste system, dowry system, female foeticide and purdah system. |
| GOAL 8 | Create stringent restrictions on the sale and promotion of alcoholic and other addictive substances: 
Sever the profit motive of the state in the sale of alcohol to prevent abuse of alcohol and associated problems. |
| GOAL 9 | Facilitating awareness, sensitisation and collectivisation of citizens: 
This should be done on issues of excluded and marginalised groups as well as laws and policies. At the same time, create an environment to facilitate the creation of collectives of people to achieve this. |
| GOAL 10 | Promote a safe and secure home environment: 
This should be done so that vulnerability at households does not expose family members, especially children, to more risk. It is also important to maintain their emotional health. |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ILLUSTRATIONS</th>
<th>GROUND-LEVEL PANEL’S GOALS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| ![Goal 11 Illustration](image1.png) | **GOAL 11**  
Promoting interests of agricultural labourers, poor farmers, peasants, tribals and slum dwellers and their rights:  
They should be protected from advancing corporate investments on land and resources. |
| ![Goal 12 Illustration](image2.png) | **GOAL 12**  
Protect the environment:  
Create stringent systems which deter companies and other business establishments from polluting the environment. |
| ![Goal 13 Illustration](image3.png) | **GOAL 13**  
Enforce mechanisms to prevent tax evasion by corporates:  
This tax should be rightfully paid to Governments who can in turn use this for the development of the poor. |
| ![Goal 14 Illustration](image4.png) | **GOAL 14**  
Creating and implementing rigidly, such systems that protect workers’ rights, including their minimum wage and social security:  
Such systems should cater to all private enterprises and bring parity between government and private wages. |
| ![Goal 15 Illustration](image5.png) | **GOAL 15**  
Promote gender equality and safety in public spaces:  
This should apply to men, women and transgenders. |
Quotes from the Panelists

“When the evicted have to be rehabilitated, the Government says they have no land but when a big company needs space, they produce 100s of acres for them” - Nandlal

“Transgenders should get equal rights because we also pay tax to the Government” - Vineetha

“Shopping malls are created in the name of development. Why don’t they employ the poor?” - Raghunath

“Why should only boys and girls have access to education - even transgenders should have the right to study” - Amrita

“There should be a national forum for poor women if their voices have to be heard” - Mayawati

“If we lose hope and sit with our arms crossed, then how will the country progress? Its difficult enough keeping a family together, this is the whole country. If we want to bring change in society and all over the country then we have to be patient, but should not lose hope” - Mayawati

“Its only once the Government stops dividing us on the lines of caste and religion that we will be able to create a peaceful society” - Ismail

“There should be some schemes out in place for single women - they are ignored by all policy makers” - Ushaben

“People who make policies are those who live safe and secure lives and thats why they dont understand our pain - if policies are being made for us, we need to be part of this process” - Nandial

“Who should get benefits of health services if not the poor?” - Shamsul

“Listening to the problems that the urban poor, I now realise that migration to cities comes at a huge cost” - Joshna

“Women don’t have the space to discuss health issues within the family. This increases risk of maternal mortality” - Sunita

“Welfare policies are only on paper and not in practice” - Ravikant

“A change of government does not bring about a change in policy” - Usha

“Ensuring access to Government schemes is like asking who will bell the cat. No takers. No accountability” - Akbar

“There should be a world where no children live on the streets” - Uzma

“When I go back to my village I feel proud that I have been able to study but also feel guilty and very bad that the other girls in my village don’t have that chance” - Pinki
The findings of the Ground-Level Panel’s recommendations were shared at an event called: Voice For Change - A Post-2015 Development Agenda By People Living In Poverty. Representatives of the Ground-Level Panel put up an exhibition of the outputs of the process and their recommendations at the event, which was attended by representatives of civil society, media and policy makers.
The Ground-Level Panel shared its recommendations and findings at Voice For Change: A Post-2015 Development Agenda By People Living In Poverty, which was held at Constitution Club, Rafi Marg, New Delhi, on July 19, 2013. At the event, GLP representatives Vineetha, Raghunath, Ushaben, Amrita and Pinki spoke about who they were, what process they followed to arrive at the recommendations and the goals themselves. “There are a number of people who are homeless and live on the sidewalks and roads, but that does not mean they are not citizens of the country,” noted one of the panelists, pointing out that “Vulnerable groups such as women, girls and transgenders are provided rewards (through tokenistic schemes). What is required is rightful place in society and not rewards.” What was reiterated in many ways was that “People who cannot pay bribes cannot move forward in life.”

Planning Commission of India member Dr Syeda Hameed, remarked favourably about the Ground-Level Panel’s recommendations to include the ban on nuclear weapons and armaments and equal participation of all countries in the United Nations ending the domination of the United States within the High-Level Panel’s goal on creating a global enabling environment. She also promised to raise some of the Ground-Level Panel’s recommendations when the Planning Commission next met on discussions of the Post-2015 development agenda.

“The poorest tend to think about society and their country much more than the rich who tend to only think of themselves,” said social activist and pioneer of the Right to Information movement Aruna Roy as she shared her thoughts on the issues raised by the Ground Level Panel. She emphasised the need for the creation of local forums to encourage people to be part of these to be able to deliberate on issues which affect peoples lives and added that all governance processes, as the GLP had suggested, should include space for people to participate.

Eminent journalist Mr Vinod Mehta said it was necessary to lobby to make voices heard and said NGOs needed to tap into the section of media that was showing sensitivity to issues of the marginalised.
Organisations that have supported us in identifying participants

ActionAid
Aga Khan Rural Support Programme (I)
Bill and Melinda Gates Foundation
Christian Aid
Gramya Vikas Manch
Indo-Global Social Service Society
Jamghat
Kalinga Institute of Social Sciences
Leonard Cheshire Disability
Mithila Gram Vikas Parishad
Pardada Pardadi Educational Society
Project Concern International
Project Orchid
Rajiv Gandhi Mahila Yojana
Tamil Nadu AIDS Initiative
Visionaries of Creative Action for Liberation and Progress
Young Voices Programme
A POST-2015 DEVELOPMENT AGENDA BY PEOPLE LIVING IN POVERTY

Notes
About Praxis

Praxis - Institute for Participatory Practices is a knowledge-based, not-for-profit development support organisation, registered in 1997 under the Indian Societies Registration Act of 1860. Since its humble beginnings, Praxis has emerged as an independent one-stop centre for undertaking action research, training and documentation dealing with multiple facets of participatory development. Our work vindicates the growing mandate across geographical boundaries that for development to be sustainable and equitable, there is an urgent need to ensure good governance practices and processes. Our strategic networking capability with like-minded people and organisations helps maximise our outreach and increases manifold the impact of our interventions.

Our vision: A world without poverty in which every person has the right to participate in decision-making processes, and to a life with dignity and choices.

Our Mission: To strive for the democratisation of development processes and institutions to ensure that the voices of poor women, men, transgenders, girls and boys are heard and acted upon.