A total of 481 aspirations were mentioned by people across 30 community labs in Bhubaneswar. These were clubbed into the 24 relevant elements. The size of the words in the cloud determine the frequency of aspirations for that element (i.e.: the larger the word, the more number of aspirations for that element were cited).
People’s Voices to Make Bhubaneswar A Child-Friendly Smart City

Report on inputs from Community Labs

Submitted by Praxis to Bhubaneswar Development Authority
November 2015
Acknowledgements

We acknowledge the support of Biswa Binayak, Swagatika, Susmita, Dhiren, Chinmaya, Priya, Manasi, Subhrajit, Prakash, Namita, Abinash, Narayana from Bhubaneswar Development Authority for facilitating the community labs and; Rabinarayan Mishra, Sudarshan Sahoo, Sasmita Nayak, Krushna Ch. Sethy, Ranjan K Acharya, Chinmayee Panda, Anand Patnaik, Braja Kishore Mohapatra, Hrushikesh Tripathy, Prasanta K Dhal, Sanjukta Panda, Hemanta K Sahoo, Srikanta Kumar Mohanty from Bhubaneswar Development Authority and Bhubaneswar Municipal Corporation for coordinating the field visits. The Praxis team that anchored the study includes Anusha Chandrasekharan, Aruna Mohan Raj, Deepti Menon, Dheeraj, Pradeep Narayanan and Sowmyaa Bharadwaj. We would like to thank Dharitri Patnaik of Bernard van Leer Foundation and Tom Thomas of Praxis for their expert inputs and Dr Krishan Kumar, the Vice Chairman of Bhubaneswar Development Authority for making this study possible. Last but not the least, we would like to thank the people of Bhubaneswar for sharing their views with us.
# Table of contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgements</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Background</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. City planning and urban mobility</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Urban utilities and Shelter</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Social and economic development</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Governance</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Interactions with children below 10 years of age</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Key Overall Inferences</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Annexure – Tool kit</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
1. Background

The Smart Cities Mission is an initiative by the Government of India’s Ministry of Urban Development aimed to drive economic growth and improve the quality of life of people by enabling local development and harnessing technology as a means to create smart outcomes for citizens. Given that the mission is operating in a phased manner, the India Smart Cities Challenge is designed, as a competition to inspire and support municipal officials as they develop smart proposals to improve residents’ lives. The challenge will take place in three rounds, for 2016-17, 2017-18 and 2018-19. In the first round, it is expected that twenty cities with exceptional proposals will be named winners.

Set against this backdrop, Bhubaneswar has employed an extensive citizen engagement process to guide its journey for transformation to a smarter city. Building upon the inputs received from the citizens, the overall approach focuses on promoting smart growth supported by sound economic development principles; while at the same time, directing investment in initiatives that promote sustainability, inclusiveness and liveability by leveraging technology as an enabler.

Building upon the features identified by the Government of India’s Smart Cities Mission, Bhubaneswar shaped its approach around the following ‘Seven Smart City Pillars’ to align the citizen’s aspirations and needs with urban systems. These are:

**SEVEN PILLARS OF THE SMART CITY**

- **Urban Mobility**
  - Street Design
  - Public transport

- **Economic Development**
  - Economy
  - Employment

- **Governance**
  - Citizen Participation
  - Intelligent Government Services

- **Shelter**
  - Inclusive Housing

- **Urban Utilities**
  - Water Supply
  - Water Management
  - Waste Management
  - Sanitation
  - Waste water management
  - Energy Supply
  - Energy Source
  - Energy Efficiency
  - Underground Electric Wires
  - IT Connectivity

- **City Planning**
  - Mixed Land Use
  - Compact Cities

- **Social Development**
  - Identity and Culture
  - Education
  - Health
  - Open Spaces
  - Safety and Security
  - Air quality

---

1. Indian Smart Cities Challenge: http://www.smartcitieschallenge.in/challenge-overview
2. Smart Cities Challenge: Make Bhubaneswar Win: http://www.smartcitybhubaneswar.gov.in/aboutbbsr
1.1 Community Labs: An intense discussion with Citizens, with proactively reaching out to citizens at margins

The Bhubaneswar Development Authority (BDA), along with the Bhubaneswar Municipal Corporation (BMC), initiated an intensive exercise to reach out to citizens through household surveys and community labs. The intent was to get the views of citizens, especially those who are at the margins by facilitating an extensive discussion and to get informed opinions of the communities, especially slum dwellers, women and children.

Figure 1. Composition of community lab respondents and categories for analysis

*Respondents were met in 30 processes - 1 with traders, 3 with school children, 3 with children in slums, 5 with mixed groups in slum, 7 with women from slums, 11 with RWA members. Five categories of respondents were evolved from the above to facilitate the analysis as seen in the figure top right.

Different people understand Smart City in different ways. To arrive at suggestions across the seven pillars, Praxis and Bernard van Leer Foundation (BVLF), with support from the BMC, organised 30 community labs. These were facilitated as two-hour intense discussions with Resident Welfare Association members, people living in slums, children in schools and in other locations, women in slums and traders.

To make this meaningful, a structured tool was created. For ease of facilitation, the first step was to club the seven pillars of the BDA’s Smart City framework into four categories (as seen in the diagram below), each comprising between two and eleven elements.
Across the 24 elements, 40 questions were evolved. Once these were canvassed, the groups were asked to share their key aspirations for each category. Once these were canvassed, the groups were asked to share their key aspirations for each category. Given that the respondents included semi-literate persons as well as young children, the tools created were visual. A sample is presented below.

The detailed tool kit is shared as Annexure 1.
People’s Voices to Make Bhubaneswar A Child-Friendly Smart City

1.2 Bhubaneswar: An Aspiring UNCRC-friendly city

The United Nations Child Rights Convention (UNCRC) categorises children’s issues into four broad rights - survival, protection, development and participation. While the 40 questions that were evolved are relevant to children, not all questions are exclusively on children.

It is pertinent here that ensuring the rights of children would also ensure rights of many other sections of population whose rights are often ignored, like women, elderly, disabled. Taking an example cited by children during a community lab, if proper traffic management is followed to ensure children can commute on the road without fear of accidents, this will ensure that senior citizens as well as people with disability are safe on the streets. Similarly, providing piped water to households will ensure that young children are not sent out to fetch water during their study or play time. At the same time, piped water in each household will also ensure that women, including pregnant women, or old people do not have to fetch water from a distance.

The diagram below places the 40 questions put to the respondents in the UNCRC categories of survival, protection, development and participation. The colours of the questions indicate the seven broad pillars (Refer to Diagram 2) from which they are drawn.
People's Voices to Make Bhubaneswar A Child-Friendly Smart City

40 QUESTIONS IN THE CHILD RIGHTS FRAMEWORK
2. City planning and urban mobility

This section includes four of the twenty-four components - transport, walkability, mixed use and compactness. Seven questions were canvassed for eliciting information for this section. The “Yes” responses to these shared by the groups are presented in the graph below.

City planning and urban mobility: Some Key Questions
(Percentages of responses in affirmative)

Does the city have facilities that make commuting safe for children (Lights, road crossing etc)?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>n=313</th>
<th>n=894</th>
<th>n=269</th>
<th>n=341</th>
<th>n=16</th>
<th>n=1348</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Do you have playgrounds/parks within 10 minutes of your residence which you access?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>n=313</th>
<th>n=894</th>
<th>n=269</th>
<th>n=341</th>
<th>n=16</th>
<th>n=1348</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2.1 Concerns

a) Most respondents agreed (more than 50 per cent) that their locality had households from all income groups. Interestingly, with respect to slums, there seems to be a dilemma which Municipal officials faced. In one of the discussions, people were vocal about slums and vendors occupying public spaces in an unauthorised manner, in another. There were slum dwellers pointing out that the administration is conspiring to shift the slums since their demand is in-situ development of slums. While they faced criticism by both groups, often the response of the Municipal officials to RWAs was that they wanted service providers to be close to their houses but did not want to deal with the slums that these service providers lived in. The question that looms large is whether a smart city will include slums
b) Discussions on mixed use and compactness gave rise to different opinions. While many stated that all classes should live together, some posh locations were quite comfortable with segregation. But overall there was a feeling that mixed use including with commercial use should not further segregate the population according to classes. Compactness has been worrying for a few, who have come from bigger cities. They are happy with Bhubaneswar not having high rises and having well spaced residences, rather than being a congested city. Their worry is that “compact” might automatically become dense, something they did not want as it would have an impact on the people and culture

c) Many respondents shared that roads were in pretty bad condition, with potholes and that children had to often walk to school, given the lack of transport facilities

d) Encroachment by street vendors through nexus with Municipal officials was another common concern for RWAs. However, they also expressed the need for vendors for two reasons- availability of a market closeby and presence of authorised vendors often make the street safe

2.2 Aspirations
When aspirations were sought related to this group of questions related to urban mobility and mixed use, 98 suggestions were made across the groups. These were clubbed into the four relevant elements (from the 24) of transport, mobility, mixed use and compactness.

a) **Well-planned city:** Housing should be decongested, link roads should connect housing to main roads

b) **Self-sufficient neighbourhoods:** Neighbourhoods should have public library, community hall, parks and gardens. There should be adequate number of crematoriums

c) **Provision of all hierarchies of roads:** Driving should made safer with improved traffic management, with fines and strict action against violators; more flyovers (with adequate exits), wide roads and separate lanes for ambulance and cycle tracks. Connecting roads should also be widened

d) **Provision of parking and safer roads:** There should also be improved parking facilities, including special facilities for people with disability and those parking in undesigned spaces should be fined. The quality of roads should be improved with reduction of speed breakers and filling of potholes.

e) **Pedestrian-friendly roads:** The roads should be made safe for all pedestrians, especially children with adequate zebra crossings, wheelchair-friendly pavements, foot-over bridges and subways. Open manholes and should be properly covered.

f) **Commuter-friendly Bhubaneswar:** Commuting should be made comfortable and affordable with public transport made available to all corners of the city and at walking distance from houses. They should be senior-citizen friendly and fares, especially of autorickshaws, should be regulated. Information about bus timings should be displayed prominently at bus stands. Metro rails should be introduced. Use of public transport should be incentivised.
3. Urban utilities and Shelter

This section looks at 12 components, based on which 16 questions are asked. The components include - Water supply, Water management, Waste water management, Sanitation, Waste management, Energy source, Energy supply, Energy efficiency, Underground electric wiring, Air quality, IT connectivity, Housing and inclusiveness.

Urban utilities and Shelter
(Percentages of responses in affirmative)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Component</th>
<th>Number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Water supply</td>
<td>313</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Water management</td>
<td>894</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Waste water management</td>
<td>269</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sanitation</td>
<td>341</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Waste management</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Energy source</td>
<td>1348</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Energy supply</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Energy efficiency</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Underground electric wiring</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Air quality</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IT connectivity</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Housing and inclusiveness</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Do women have access to safe toilets in public spaces? (Railway stations, mall and bus stand)?

- **12**
- **3**
- **0**
- **0**
- **0**
- **5**

Do you have access to affordable housing schemes?

- **39**
- **18**
- **8**
- **42**
- **0**
- **21**

16 questions were canvassed for eliciting information for this section. The “Yes” responses to these shared by the groups are presented in the graph below.
People’s Voices to Make Bhubaneswar A Child-Friendly Smart City

Urban Utilities - Water, Sanitation and Waste
(Percentages of responses in affirmative)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Water supply</th>
<th>Do you have access to government supplied safe drinking water?</th>
<th>Do you use harvested rain water?</th>
<th>Does the area have a safe sewerage system? (Unsafe is overflowing, open)</th>
<th>Do women have access to safe toilets in public spaces (shopping areas etc)</th>
<th>Is there a Government supported system of door to door collection of waste?</th>
<th>Are you expected to segregate waste at source?</th>
<th>Are common garbage dumps in your area cleaned weekly?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Water management</td>
<td>15 21 63</td>
<td>0 10 20</td>
<td>7 20 17</td>
<td>12 0 6</td>
<td>67 29 38</td>
<td>3 0 0 5</td>
<td>16 0 2 4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

RWA n=313  Slum n=894  Slum Women n=341
Children n=269  Commercial n=16  Total n=1348

Urban Utilities - Energy, IT and Air
(Percentages of responses in affirmative)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Energy supply</th>
<th>Are there adequate functional street lights in your locality?</th>
<th>Are street lights in your area switched on and off on time?</th>
<th>Are transformers in your locality covered and well protected to keep children away from harm?</th>
<th>Are you satisfied with the quality of internet?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Energy efficiency</td>
<td>37 24 17</td>
<td>45 13</td>
<td>19 28</td>
<td>191 41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IT connectivity</td>
<td>52 38</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>63</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

RWA n=313  Slum n=894  Slum Women n=341
Children n=269  Commercial n=16  Total n=1348
3.1 Concerns

a) Respondents mentioned that with increase in number of high rises the amenities, especially the sewerage system, is unable to take the pressure of the increasing number of houses leading to frequent overflows. They stated that the city should be spread out and not grow vertically since it will increase the pressure on various amenities.

b) Most respondents in slums did not possess smart phones or computers to access internet, leave alone having internet connections. With Bhubaneswar aspiring to be a smart city with smart governance and most services available online, then the administration will have to think about those on the other side of the digital divide — those with no devices to access internet even if provided for free.

c) Discussions around utilities and amenities threw light on the disparate conditions in RWAs and slums. The slums had no water pipeline connection so they had to stand in queue for long hours, no electricity supply, the garbage dumps were not cleared and sanitation was a major concern with most households not having toilets and the condition of community toilets in a bad state. The people living in slums wanted government to provide low-cost housing schemes and in-situ development of slums. They wanted the houses to have all basic amenities.
3.2 Aspirations

When aspirations were sought related to this group of questions related to urban utilities and shelter, 195 suggestions were made across the groups.

a) Adequate water supply: There should be adequate supply of water especially in slum locations. There should be provision of pipeline water connections in slum locations so that women and children do not have to spend long hours to collect water.

b) Check on air pollution: The government should take measures to check on vehicular pollution by promoting CNG and eco-friendly vehicles. Trees should be planted trees (specifically the area near industrial area). School Bus should be provided for pick up so that people do not have to use individual cars.

c) Use renewable energy: The government should tap into renewable energy sources such as Solar and wind energy supply. The government should also install solar street lights and install solar panels in buildings.

d) Safe and timely supply of electricity: Electricity Transformers should be properly maintained and covered to avoid mishaps. The government should provide 24x7 electricity supply. There should be fewer power cuts during summer. There should be coordination between BMC and other departments to ensure that repeated digging does not disrupt electricity.

e) Pipeline supply of cooking gas

f) Shelter and accessibility to housing: The government should provide housing schemes that are in budget, subsidised or free housing schemes for the poor. There should be pucca houses for all slum dwellers and homeless - one family should have one house. Houses should have proper ventilation.

g) Improved access to internet: The government should provide free wifi internet connection.

h) Availability and access to functional toilets and bathrooms: The government should construct bathrooms and toilets at public places such as parks, markets, etc. Toilets specifically for women and children should be made available. The existing toilets should be properly maintained and construct more functional public toilets at every 10-15 kms. Sanitary napkins should be available at each public toilet. Community Bathrooms should also be constructed.

i) Safe supply of electricity: The government should provide electricity through underground protected wiring.

j) Provision of bins and timely collection of waste: Garbage should be regularly cleaned and its segregation into wet and dry waste should be enforced. There should be provision for adequate number of common dumping points that are cleared regularly.

k) Safe sewerage system: The present condition of sewerage system needs to be improved and drainage system should be developed in slum areas. The city should have access to treated water.

l) Rain water harvesting: Government should support housing complexes in adopting the process of rain water harvesting to restore ground water level. The government should also construct artificial water bodies and water storage system.
4. Social and economic development

This section looks at six components, based on which 12 questions are asked. The components include economy and employment, identity and culture, education, health, public open spaces and safety and security.

Social and economic development: Some Key Questions
(Percentages of responses in affirmative)

Do Government Schools in your locality have good quality education?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>n=313</th>
<th>n=894</th>
<th>n=269</th>
<th>n=341</th>
<th>n=16</th>
<th>n=1348</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Are all of your family members employed in Jobs commensurate to their skills?

|                | 34    | 12    | 10    | 14    | 19   | 17     |

The “Yes” responses to the twelve questions in this category are presented in the graphs below:
4.1 Concerns

a) Various groups raised the significance of quality education as it determined the future of individuals, while discussing that the quality of education in Government schools was found wanting. While this was both with the quality of teachers as well as the physical infrastructure of schools and was flagged by those in RWAs as well as slums, largely slum residents feel the brunt, as they cannot afford to send their children to private schools.

b) There is a need for creating employability opportunities for youth who have graduate and post graduate degrees in a diverse range of subjects. Respondents across groups felt that their working family members were not in jobs commensurate to their skills or qualifications.

c) Slum as well as RWA residents often stated child labour as a dilemma. For the slum residents, they shared that the adult family members are often unable to find jobs to support the family and even though they know it is “not right” they send their children out to work so that the family can make ends meet. Similarly at RWAs, several people stated that they were often the employers of children, even though they knew it was wrong, because they felt that...
it is better to employ children from poorer families as domestic help in their own houses and provide them economic relief rather than send them out to work in hazardous conditions.

d) All groups raised the need for maintenance of safe parks and playgrounds in the vicinity - whether it was children or senior citizens, those living in RWAs or slums. The parks were in a state of ill-repair, often used for anti-social activities and invariably perceived as unsafe as there were no lights or security guards. Slum residents raised the issue that there are some pay and use parks which are in good condition but that parks should be free for all.

e) There is a lot of openness to use Government health facilities even among RWA residents, as they feel that private health practitioners are fleecing them, but they feel that the quality of services at Government health set ups has deteriorated quite a lot over time.

f) People feel that there is no effort either on the part of the Government or other local groups to generate interest about conservation of monuments and sites of cultural importance.

4.2 Aspirations

a) Availability of child friendly and safe public spaces: Safe playgrounds and parks should be available within ten minutes of walking distance from residences and easily accessible by children. Separate space should be created for women and girls in parks and safety and security measures should be in place. The parks should be open to use by the public irrespective of their economic background residents of the locality along with facilities for recreation. Different spaces for recreation for all groups should also be developed – such as community halls and public libraries.

b) Education- Access to Knowledge and related amenities: The government should ensure a common curriculum for all, as of now there are too many different education boards and the quality of education differs drastically. The number of schools, especially high schools should increase and Government School should appoint more staff to manage numbers. Schools should be available at close proximity to the house (at least within 10-15 minutes on foot). The schools should have bigger playgrounds along with a sports coaching facility. There should be provision of adventure sports in school such as rock climbing, other activities like dance, and formation of groups such as NCC, Scouts and Guides should be promoted.

c) Access and Availability to Employment: The government should identify and must create employment opportunities for people with disabilities, those who are skilled and semi-skilled. They should focus on providing employment opportunities to women closer to their residences. Along with generating employment the government should also develop skills of the citizens. They should provide trainings related to banking, computer skills and technical education. The government should also provide labour cards. Citizens should be proactively made aware about complaint mechanisms for child labour.

d) Health: There should be good, functional health centres in the vicinity. Dispensaries should be upgraded in terms of providing good quality treatment. There should be good quality Government medical facilities available round the clock. Government health facilities should have well qualified doctor and modern technology and services as well as free medicines should be available to people from economically weaker sections. There should be mechanisms to ensure that expired medicines are not given out at health facilities.
5. Governance

This section looks at two components, intelligent government services and citizen partnership, based on which five questions were asked.

**Governance**
(Percentages of responses in affirmative)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>n=313</th>
<th>n=894</th>
<th>n=269</th>
<th>n=341</th>
<th>n=16</th>
<th>n=1348</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Have you participated in any ward level consultation?</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Are online platform child friendly (easily understood by children)?</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The “Yes” responses to the five questions in this category are presented in the graphs below:
5.1 Concerns

Participation of people in the governance is low:

a) There are few platforms where people can participate in ward level decision-making processes. Discussions are organised with people once in a while. In fact, the consultations organised in connection with the Smart City campaign seemed to be the first for many people, especially in the resident welfare associations. People in slums did acknowledge having discussions with corporators on a regular basis. However, they felt this was more of a ritual as nothing changed after the interactions or because of them. In particular, there was a lack of children’s participation in different aspects of governance.
b) People’s participation in reviewing and monitoring projects and services was minimal. While they did file complaints and grievances, lack of action or adequate response to the complaints caused disillusionment with the system. This led to reduced proactiveness of citizen participation in governance.

c) Further, the administration also did not voluntarily provide details to the people on services and expenses on the services proactively, pointing to a lack of accountability.

d) There was a lack of awareness on ways in which citizens could participate in governance. This did not only revolve around activities related to the administration, but also to specific programmes such as the Smart City campaign itself.

Having said that, the people had not lost trust with the urban administration. It can be seen from the way the people participated voluntarily in this process despite very short notice and despite the timing of the meeting being inconvenient to many. This also is visible in the enthusiasm with which suggestions came up, not only about what the government and administration could do, but also what citizens could themselves do.

5.2 Aspirations

When aspirations were sought related to this group of questions related to governance, 58 suggestions were made across the groups. These were clubbed into two relevant elements (from the 24) of intelligent government services and citizen participation.

a) Mechanisms of participation, especially of children: Increased participation of younger generation / slum dwellers in government’s planning processes as well as ward level meetings. Bal panchayat / children's groups / child clubs should be set up and meetings with people in general and students in particular should be organised regularly. A functional public grievance cell, common helplines to register complaints and a suggestion box for feedback should be installed in localities. Information kiosks can be set up. Online complaint facilities and child-friendly online portals should be set up to make interaction between people and the administration easier.

b) Citizen role in governance: Citizen responsibility in maintenance of public utilities could be supplemented by active monitoring of government projects through monitoring toolkits, awareness about government services / facilities and rights and ongoing campaigns, etc.

c) Transparent governance: Administration has to be proactively transparent. It has to disclose all services it is providing and also expense details about different projects in the public domain. Corruption was cited as important problem. This could be addressed if there was transparent monitoring of expenses and fixing of responsibility for various projects. Expenses related to public works should be proactively displayed; special department to access governance related services should be set up. There should be enforcement of approved plans while construction. There could be a single window system for bill payments / accessing government schemes / Registration of property to be made simpler

In addition, in slum locations, respondents specifically demanded government documents like ration card and Below Poverty Line cards. Some senior citizens sought mechanisms to help them pay taxes like door-to-door visits and guidance on using websites for such facilities.
6. Interactions with children below 10 years of age

In addition to the community labs analysed above, the team interacted with 39 children below the age of ten in some of the locations. Illustrating the facilities in their homes and schools, the children mentioned a few aspirations, which are listed below.

1. Children in Adibasi Goan (Saliasahi), Bhubaneswar, shared the following aspirations.
2. Construction of drains for removal / treatment of wastewater
3. Streetlights on the pathways inside the basti to make it safe for children
4. Nutritious and healthy food at schools
5. Well-constructed doors and ceilings and adequate number of toilets for boys and girls in schools
6. Regular police rounds inside the basti to ensure safety
7. Adequate provision of ration at stipulated rate
8. A playground in every basti
9. Children should study and not be forced to work.
10. Better roads within the basti
11. Local representatives should visit basti regularly and resolve all the issues.

Students of Classes 1 to 4 from UGME school in Press Colony, Bhubaneswar, listed out the different amenities they had in their homes and slums.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Space/utility/ freedom</th>
<th>Whether exists</th>
<th>Whether they want</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Playground</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Swings</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Time to play</td>
<td>Boys: Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Girls: No</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Transport to school</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No (Not required)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Water</td>
<td>Yes but not independent household taps</td>
<td>Yes (pipeline connection)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Story books</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 Street lights</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 Potholes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9 Friends</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 Toilets</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### School and facilities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Facilities the school has</th>
<th>Facilities they want</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Playground</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toys / sports equipment</td>
<td>Football, cricket bat and ball, badminton rackets</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Park equipment</td>
<td>There is one slide in one corner of the playground that the children use</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toilets</td>
<td>There are two toilets – one for boys and one for the girls. There was a separate toilet for teachers. Except for one girl, all others used the toilet at least once a day.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bench/tables</td>
<td>All classrooms have tables for teachers. The computer room has benches for students. In other classes, children sit on the floor.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drinking water</td>
<td>There is piped drinking water for students. As it runs on motor, there is usually no shortage, even in summers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bags and books</td>
<td>Children carry books to school everyday. Of the 15 children, eight said that the bags were very heavy and as a result of it, they had a pain in their shoulders occasionally</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food</td>
<td>Food is not cooked within the school. It gets cooked outside and brought to the school.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Classrooms</td>
<td>There are seven rooms for seven classes and a computer room. All classes have a table chair for the teachers, blackboards, dusters, chalks in different colours, lights and fans.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The needs of the children are related to the various elements discussed, be it urban utilities to safety, good education, water and sanitation, open spaces, road and transport, all of which are relevant for their overall development and safe growth.
7. Key Overall Inferences

1. People want a proactive and responsive administration that discloses information about projects and expenses on a regular basis and makes itself accountable. Mechanisms like creation of ‘citizens charter’ by each department can be explored. Twenty-four states and Union Territories have issued 729 charters and Odisha is not one of them. Taking the initiative one step further, Bhubaneswar could come up with child-friendly charters in the form of citizen report cards.

2. There is a need for more spaces for people’s participation, especially for children and the poor. As seen in the graphs above, participation of poor is higher in governance mechanisms despite their access to services being much lower. It is the poor who make democracy a participation sport and not a spectator sport. The administration should take this further and provide spaces for participation through action taken / feedback / display boards in prominent spaces as suggested in the aspirations by the respondents.

3. The need for treated piped drinking water for every household and every institution has emerged as significant.

4. Equity is an important factor in going forward. Inclusiveness of the city, in the sense of facilitating people of all sections in living together and using common services, organically keeps the citizenry active, dynamic and united. Features like the neighbourhood school system needs to be brought about to help all sections interact with each other. Public common spaces are often the sites for people to meet and talk to each other especially during events and festivals.

5. Sanitation and waste management is going to be a bigger challenge as city expands. Significant planning for the sewerage system and effective waste management should be undertaken and in place, now itself before the city expands further. Embracing modern technology options is key here.

6. Pollution of water and air and its impact on health, especially of children of 0 to 6 years should be an important focus area for the smart city planning process. In this, cooperation from the people is important and there should campaigns launched for sensitising all citizens. It would be good if children lead these campaigns. Given the way compactness has been visualized by the Smart Cities initiative, there was concern that hazardous industries could pollute the air and water through effluents, further affecting the health of children. Locating industries near residences or schools may actually prove lethal. In addition, respondents raised the issue of the large number of private vehicles on the streets and called for more fuel-efficient, accessible, well-connected and child-friendly public transport as well as car pooling.

7. Issues related to gender need to be mainstreamed. They are closely linked to equitable access of all to all spaces at all times. Girls in schools complained about toilets and menstrual hygiene issues, including the need for supply of low cost sanitary napkins. Everyone felt the need for clean and safe public toilets, especially for women, in all public spaces. Safety is also an important issue. No area is safe for women once it gets dark, reinforcing once again that some spaces are not accessible by women and children. Every citizen’s right to realise full human potential through non-restrictive mobility enabling fuller choices for a girl child/ woman must be ensured.
8. Annexure – Tool kit

- Are there family members eligible for jobs who are currently unemployed?
- Is there a functional RCDS centre in your area?
- Are you involved in programs to conserve your local culture?
- Do you participate in programs to stop child labour?

**Economy & Employment Safety & Security Health**

- Are there designated safe spaces for your children to play?
- Are Government measures taken to prevent seasonal illness?
- Are there Heritage buildings in your locality that are in poor conditions?

- Are all of your family members employed in jobs commensurate to their skills?
- Do you access government health centres for primary health care?
- Do your children go to a school that is within 10 minutes walking distance?

**Identity & Culture Education Public Open Spaces**

- Have parking spaces substituted open spaces/playgrounds in the last five years?
- Do you have playgrounds within 10 minutes of your residence which you access?

**Transport Walkability Compactness Mixed Use**

- Is the city safe for children to use cycle in the city?
- Can you use a government bus to go to any corner of the city?
- Does your locality have household from income group?
- Does the city have wheelchair friendly pavement?
People’s Voices to Make Bhubaneswar A Child-Friendly Smart City

Water Supply
- Do you have access to Government Supplied drinking water?
- Do you use harvested rain water?
- Do you have access to safe toilets in public spaces? (Train station, mall and bus stand)

Water Management
- Does your locality have safe sewage system (unsafe is open and overflowing)?
- Are you expected to segregate waste at source?

Sanitation
- Is there a government supported system of door to door collection of waste?
- Are common garbage dumps cleaned regularly? (once in two days)

Housing and inclusiveness
- Are transformers in your locality covered stand will project to keep children away?

Energy Supply
- Have you had fire accidents and mishap in the last five years due to wire and electrical pole?
- Are there adequate functional street light in your locality?

Energy Source
- Are you satisfied with the quality of the internet?

Underground Electric Wiring
- Does any of your children have respiratory issues because of air quality?

Air Quality
- Are street lights in your area switched on and off on time?

IT Connectivity
- Do you have 24 hours of power supply?
- Have you used any online/offline platforms to file complaints?

Does the administration proactively share/display any expense statement on public work?

Citizen Participation
- Have you participated in any ward level consultation?

Intelligent Government Services
- Have you raised by bal panchayat children clubs included in the ward plan?